

The article my daughters have no mother by mutchnick

Literature



**ASSIGN
BUSTER**

Refutation Essay: " My Daughters Have No Mother" al Affiliation Refutation Essay: " My Daughters Have No Mother" The article written by Mutchnick (2009) entitled " My Daughters Have No Mother" and published online in The Huffington Post on the 27th of February, 2009 presented issues that apparently generated controversial comments from various readers. Mutchnick's (2009) contention was that since his two daughters were allegedly borne through a surrogate, he apparently coined the surrogate as an oven, and as such, pegged that his daughters have no mother. One vehemently disagrees with the contention that the daughters have no mother for reasons that are presented below.

The author is gravely mistaken by asserting that his daughters have no mother for the reason that they were born through a surrogate. As such, Mutchnick (2009) also alleged that since the conception process used an egg donor, who he never had the chance to meet, he naturally concluded that the daughters have no mother. One strongly believes that all people were borne from biological mothers. And, even if the children is subsequently given up for adoption, or have been conceived through the surrogate method, a mother still has existed.

Concurrently, it was erroneous for the author to presume that the oven is a term that is analogous to a mother. These are two anti-thetical terms: an inanimate object versus a living human being. Thus, Mutchnick (2009) could have used the term to inject humor to his literary discourse, but still, he could not validly assert that his daughters have no mother since the donor, who have contributed the eggs; and the surrogate are female human beings who have the capabilities to bear a child. As such, they could or could not be

a mother, at the time of contracting an agreement with them, but as soon as the child was born, the surrogate mother is identified as the biological mother.

Finally, the author could indeed assert that motherhood needs to be perfected only when the role and responsibilities of a mother has been duly accorded. Since the daughters were apparently borne from the efforts and purpose prescribed by Mutchnick, they apparently have assumed the role and responsibilities that mothers usually undertake. As such, he affirms that his daughters do not have a mother. One's response to this argument is that: the daughters could in fact not have a biological or legally recognized mother - but still, by the fact that they were borne from a female human being, they still have a biological; yet not recognized or known mother. From an article written by Rogers (2012) which qualifies the definition of a mother, in cases of legal battles that ensue out of the surrogate process, it was emphasized that " the children will have no legally recognized " mother"" (Rogers, 2012, par. 7). The author is not therefore reliably accurate and correct to state that these daughters do not have a mother. He should have clearly qualified his erroneous statement.

Finally, Mutchnick (2009) admitted that he had " to call our surrogate an oven because I cant call her their mother and I cant call V139K2 (not her real name) their mother. And it drives me crazy" (Mutchnick, 2009, par. 12). One honestly believes that since he was driven by emotions and not by logical thinking, he was not effectively using his cognitive and analytical skills in apparently coining an accurate analogy for the word ' mother'. As such, it clearly and evidently proves that the author was erroneous in stating that his

daughters have no mother. As the facts revealed, a female mother giving birth to a child already immediately and naturally makes this individual the biological mother, regardless of subsequent assumption or non-assumption of roles and responsibilities linked to motherhood.

References

Mutchnick, M. (2009, February 27). My Daughters Have No Mother. Retrieved from The Huffington Post: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/max-mutchnick/my-daughters-have-no-moth_b_170614.html?

Rogers, B. (2012, September 20). Court case may define what a "mother" is. Retrieved from Chron: <http://www.chron.com/news/houston-texas/article/Court-case-may-define-what-a-mother-is-3882131.php>