

Validity of claims made in weight management research by aphramor

[Health & Medicine](#)



Center for Disease Control's epidemiological data reveals that mortality risk in severe obesity is not statistically significant and contradictory that obese people live longer than healthy people.

Healthy weight approaches are debated vigorously in scientific circles and there is a lack of representation in previous researches. Apart from that clinical practice accepted standards and ethics of publishing have given a sort of immunity to the subject of weight loss.

Method:

Narrative literature reviews of journal articles are carried out that was published in The Journal of Human Nutrition and Diabetics from 2004 to 2008. Articles on diabetic research were chosen using a purposive sample technique, with weight loss as their main focus from 2004 to 2008 for analysis to assess the validity of the claims made in weight management research.

Findings:

The author from the analysis of the diabetic articles found that the research in weight management is dominated by the energy deficit approach even though it has a high rate of long term failure. The evidence from the available sources negates the claims of weight management programs expected success and the complexities and controversies in the supporting evidence are discussed insufficiently in the agenda of this current research.

The findings of the research from the review of diabetic articles focused on weight loss are that,

- a. Without sufficient supporting references it is accepted that BMI > 25 is a health risk, indicates poor health and weight loss is an effective remedy for fitness.
- b. Claim that Weight loss treatment provides overall health benefits are not specified and are unsubstantiated in those articles.
- c. Blood lipids and blood pressure can be regulated through weight loss, the claim also cannot be validated because the article reviewed by the author itself concludes that lipids and lipoproteins changes by only dietary fat's influence are not possible to identify.
- d. Diabetes can be prevented by effective weight management cannot be ascertained from the review of diabetic literature.
- e. Weight loss, dieting or energy deficit results in health improvement and fitness and are effective and reliable methods cannot be established because there is no scientific proof, that can be found in the literature, however, it was found that weight loss is not a means for achieving fitness but an end in itself. However from the diabetic articles reviewed it was found that these methods have long term adverse effects on health and fitness.

Article conclusion:

The author concluded from the review of diabetic articles focused on weight loss that the claims made against the consequences of overweight and obesity and treatment are required to remain healthy are not supported by enough scientific evidence. The claims given for justifying the treatment for

obesity that Weight loss is an effective remedy and results in improved health lacks sufficient evidence. Weight loss justification and the treatment do not meet the standards of evidence required for medicine. Also, the author found that there are no discussions on the ethical implications of such treatments, lack of research on alternative approaches centered on non-weight management encourages the regimes of ineffective treatment. The author towards the end of the article recommends an alternative approach such as HAES referring to 'no-diet or size acceptance approach' or in simple terms health at every size instead of weight management.

Good points of the article:

According to me the good points of the article were that the author laid down the research problem very specifically and dealt with it layer by layer so that it is easy for the reader to understand her point and the research. The purposive sample technique was appropriate for the research. The article was interesting and very in-depth research was carried out using sufficient and supportive evidence. The results arrived were well presented and discussions gave a good analysis and the research has good implications for further research and recommendation health at every size is outstanding.

Poor points of the article:

Even though the research article had many good points, yet there were few poor points too. The research article lacked the heading conclusion, the author after 'discussions' heading, moved on to 'implications for research and practice', even though it is given in the Abstract section. Due to lack of

conclusion heading it makes a reader difficult to know the research conclusions and recommendations and he might get confused. Readers need to read through both discussion and implications section to arrive at a conclusion and what the author recommended. Also, it was a narrative review of diabetic literature, the author did not use any figures or tables which would have been good for raising the readers' interest otherwise article becomes boring and readers lose interest in the middle. Figures and tables are easy to grasp and makes an article more interesting.