

# The concerns of the management team of all star industries

[Business](#), [Management](#)



Is it ethical or unethical to buy body parts? Would your view change if it was for yourself or a loved one? In the case study in question, it is easy to understand the concerns of the management team of All Star Industries. The management's fears of a public relations backlash are realistic, especially since organ transplant via dubious procurement channels throw up ethical and legal conundrums. To be fair to Yvonne, she's not done anything criminal. Every individual has a right to life, albeit within certain legal and ethical limits. And Yvonne has not brazenly or blatantly breached these limits, especially since the company has no written policy on organ transplants. Hence, it would be unfair to mark down Yvonne for any policy violation. Considering all the facts of the case, it is fairly clear that the potential public relations backlash that the management fears is purely their problem. Consequently, Yvonne is entitled to have a full refurbishment of costs for the surgical procedure. The suspicion that she may have acquired the kidney via unauthorized channels is again a problem for the regulators and policy makers, taking for granted the basic entitlement of a citizen to. Looking exclusively at the issue of buying body parts, one can take guidance from principles of environmental ethics in ascertaining the legitimacy and ethicality of particular decisions. (Ashley et. al, 2006, p. 47) It is important to remember that regulating transplants and aiming to stamp out illegal trading in organs is the need of the hour, for this practice is seen as tainting medical standards and causing a shortage of donated organs for those most in need. Critics of the practice bemoan how transplant surgery in China has now become

“ a cash cow, due to the rising trade in illegal organs and the fact that many

hospitals offer the operations despite having staff who are poorly qualified to carry them out or inadequately supervised. The illegal organ trade has led to a severe shortage of donated organs, to the extent that it is estimated that only around 20, 000 transplants can be carried out annually despite up to 2 million Chinese people needing these operations every year.” (Perspectives in Public Health, 2006, p. 152)

Social class also plays a major role in who gets the transplant and who does not. For a Chinese company like All Star Industries, this is a sensitive issue, for despite all the genuine intentions behind approving Yvonne’s claim, they could be perceived as siding with the elite – an image that could damage their business prospects. Further, many foreigners from advanced nations also visit China for transplants as they “ are far more affordable than prices for the same operations in Western Europe, thus pushing the poorer Chinese people (80% of whom have no medical insurance) still further down the queue”. (Gudorf & Huchingson, 2010, p. 114) Hence, as things stand today, organ transplant operations in China do not satisfy all ethical imperatives. Yet, in the particular case of Yvonne, it would be unfair on part of the management to decline her medical claim.

#### References

- Ashley, B. M., DeBlois, J. K., & O'Rourke, K. D. (2006). *Health Care Ethics: A Catholic Theological Analysis*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press.
- Gudorf, C. E., & Huchingson, J. E. (2010). *Boundaries: A Casebook in Environmental Ethics*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press.
- Lock, M. (2002). *Twice Dead: Organ Transplants and the Reinvention of Death*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

New Committee to Regulate Organ Transplants. (2006). Perspectives in Public Health, 126(4), 152.