New criticism vs. reader response criticism assignment

Art & Culture



What is more accurate, new criticism or reader response criticism? The answer Is neither, seeing as both styles of critic views and analyzes the topic at hand and gives feedback. Though both styles offer feedback, they are different forms of feedback entirely. New criticism involves focusing on the material at hand, and not what It was meant to be perceived as, to Judge the topic by every measurable feature possible. Reader response criticism is when a reader or a Judge would Inspect the topic up and down, left and right.

The reader Is not Judging based on hard facts, but as to hat the topic means to the reader, how It makes him feel and how he views the topic differently from what the creator may have Intended. When explaining food for example, one could say this dish has a lot of salt, or not enough flavoring, or you could say that this dish brings back memories of your childhood. Neither response Is Inaccurate, nor are they fully correct. A response Is entirely subjective and could vary in the eye of the beholder.

New criticism is harsh and severe, basing their feedback off hard facts of the topic. Food for example, is one topic that people could use new criticism. My mother sakes a dish every Friday night called "Match". It is an Israeli dish made up of roasted red peppers and tomatoes, usually served cold. A judge using new criticism might mention things like the texture is not right, or that the intensity of the spicy flavor is not up to par. He could say something like, the texture is just perfect and the density is not too thick and not too soft.

He views this food as nothing but another dish, noticing its faults and its feats. Reader response criticism is a different story. Though the Judge who views my mothers cooking with new criticism may bluntly say what is wrong

with the food or hat is perfect, reader response criticism entails a new way of looking at my mothers dish. L, for example, do not inspect my mothers cooking, to ensure sure it has enough salt, or that it is not high in spices to the point where I could not eat it.

I criticize the food differently. When the plate is brought out to the dinner table, my first Interaction with it is its delicious aroma. This aroma does not bring to my attention if the food is well prepared or not, but it takes me back to my childhood memories where I can see my grandmother making me the same dish in Israel, where I am dated around my entire family. This dish means more to me then a delicious salad- type dish, but it is a representation of the strength of our family as a whole.

This dish Is a symbol of what brings our family together at the dinner table, Joining us for one purpose. Many people may see a movie and Judge the movie based on a number of things. Say there was a movie based on a high school basketball team that against all odds made It to the state finals and lost. A normal cartel may comment on the skill levels of the actors Involved, or they may bring up the topic of the depth of the plot. They may bring to some peoples attention what was wrong with the story, what did not make Others may see this movie differently.

One viewer, could have been part of a high school athletic team, and could understand and relate to the hardships that the boys had to go through to make it to where they did. He might understand the excitement they felt when making it to the finals, or the pain they went through when the game clock hit zero. Both forms of criticism may be accurate, but how you view a

movie or a dish can vary on the experiences you may have went through or the past you may be used to.