

Impact of print media on society essay

[Art & Culture](#), [Music](#)



**ASSIGN
BUSTER**

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE DOVE EVOLUTION FILM AS A ONE-SHOT MEDIA LITERACY TREATMENT by DANIEL AARON WHEELER A. A.

Alabama Christian College 1979 B. A. Western Illinois University 1989 M. A.

University of Alabama 1994 A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education in the Department of Educational Studies in the College of Education at the University of Central Florida Orlando, Florida Spring Term 2009 Major Professors: Cynthia J.

Hutchinson, E. Lea Witta ©2009 Daniel Aaron Wheeler ii ABSTRACTThe

purpose of this study is to test the effectiveness of the Dove Evolution film as a one-shot media literacy treatment to change sociocultural attitudes toward appearance. Four speech classes at the University of Central Florida were used in a Solomon fourgroup design. Group 1 received a posttest; Group 2 received a pretest and a posttest; Group 3 received the treatment and posttest; and Group 4 received the pretest, treatment and posttest. The treatment consisted of the Dove Evolution film, a viral video introduced in 2006 by Dove as part of its Campaign for Real Beauty. The film has received 19 million views on the Internet in 2. years.

A modified version of the Sociocultural Attitudes Towards Appearance Questionnaire (SATAQ-3) was administered as a pretest and posttest, measuring four variables such as awareness and internalization of the media ideal, pressure to achieve the media ideal, and desire to be athletic. It was hypothesized that the treatment would raise awareness but lower internalization, pressure and desire to be athletic. Although none of the hypotheses were supported, there were statistically significant changes.

Contrary to expectations, the awareness measure decreased and the pressure score increased. The results and implications are discussed. iii This effort is dedicated to the glory of God (1 Corinthians 10: 31). iv

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS I am grateful for my committee members: Dr.

Cynthia Hutchinson, for her excellent coaching as my major professor through the doctoral program; Dr. David Boote, for his thorough, thoughtful and timely feedback over the course of the program; Dr. Eleanor Witta for her patience in dealing with the statistically challenged, and Dr. Rufus Barfield, a researcher and brother in Christ, who literally took me by the hand and prayed with me and our wives in my church office when I really needed it.

I am grateful for my teachers: Drs. Kay Allen, Edmund Short, Robert Lange, David Boote, Larry Holt, Lea Witta, Steven Collins, Steve Conley, Albert Pryor, Tim Brown, Cynthia Hutchison, Stephen Sivo, Rick Kenney and George Pawlas. The information and insight I gained through their courses I will always appreciate and will put to good use.

I am indebted to my cohort members for their help as we worked together: Cory Knowles, Debra Campeau, Darlene DePalma, Edie Gaythwaite, Won-yoo Kim, Marty Norris, Keith Riley, Jill Fjelstul, Patty McNeese, Stephanie Hull, Zhaodan Huang, and Jackie Davis who kept urging ? You can do it? over the course of the last year. Many other classmates along the way made this journey more fun. I am indebted to Mrs. Karisa Workman, speech instructor, who graciously allowed me access to her communication classes for my dissertation research. She made that part easy. I am indebted to the elders

of the Concord Street Church of Christ: Brothers Churck Lipford, Bob Cawthon, Jerry Dickinson, Ulysses Campbell, Jerry Liddick and Anthony Washington.

Without their blessing and the generous sabbatical from preaching duties to allow me to finish and defend my dissertation, I could not have finished. I am indebted to the members of the Concord Street Church of Christ, who prayed for me as deadlines approached, rejoiced with me at my successes, and gleefully calling me ? Dr. Dan? after my defense. I am indebted to my dear family for their love, support and encouragement; my son Nathan, daughter-in-law, Cheryl, and our new granddaughter, Lydia Grace; my son Bobby; and my daughter Janna and son-in-law, Logan. You all make it fun to be ? Dad? and ? Grandpa.

? I am especially indebted to my wife and best friend, Grace, without whose patience and understanding I could not have endured this effort. We’ve grown a lot in our journey together. Most of all, I am indebted to Almighty God and His Son Jesus for His redeeming blood.

I pray that I will be a faithful minister and this doctorate degree will be to their glory. In more ways than one, I’ve been saved by Grace. vi TABLE OF CONTENTS LIST OF FIGURES

...

.....

.....

.....

...

.....

.....

.....

....

....

.....

....

.....

.....

.....

....

.....

.....

...

....

....

.....

....

...

... x LIST OF TABLES ..

....

.....

...

....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

....

...

.....

.....

.....

....

.....

....

.....

.....

.....

....

..... i LIST OF ACRONYMS/ABBREVIATIONS ..

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

....

.....

.....

...

.....

.....

.....

....

....

...

.....

..... xii CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION ..

.....

.....

....

...

.....

.....

...

.....

.....

...

....

.....

...

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

....

.. 1 Introduction .

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....	1
Need for the Study	
..... Purpose	
.....	
..... 10 Theoretical Framework	
.....	10
Research Hypotheses	
.....	
11 Definition of terms	
.....	
..... 2 Design of the Study	
.....	
.... 13 Limitations of this Study	
.....	13
Organization of this Dissertation	
.....	14 CHAPTER
TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	
.....	5 Introduction
.....	
..... 15 Paradigm Shift	
.....	
..... 18 Review of Studies	
.....	
..... 23 Media Literacy as Intervention for Critical Thinking Skills	

..... 4 Media Literacy as Intervention for Alcohol Use.....	25
Media Literacy as Intervention for Violence	
..... 26 Media Literacy as Intervention for Smoking	
27 Media Literacy as Intervention for Sexual Objectification	
..... 28 Media Literacy as Intervention for Eating Disorders	29
Theoretical Framework	
.....	42
vii Summary	
.....	
..... 44 CHAPTER THREE: METHODS	
.....	5
Introduction	
.....	
..... 45	
Methodology.....	
..... 45 Population and Design	
.....	45
Treatment	
.....	
..... 6 Measurements	
.....	
..... 47 Factor Analysis of “ The Media and You” Pretest	

..... 48 Factor Analysis of “ The	
Media and You” Posttest	49
Procedure	
.....	
..... 1 Summary	
.....	
..... 52 CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS	
.....	53
Introduction	
..... 53 Analysis	
.....	
..... 3 Hypothesis	
1.....	
..... 53 Hypothesis	
2.....	
..... 55 Hypothesis	
3.....	
..... 57 Hypothesis	
4.....	
..... 8 Summary	
.....	
..... 63 CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION	
.....	64
Introduction	
.....	

.....	64
Discussion.....	
.....	4 Data Analysis
.....	
.....	66 Hypothesis
1.....	
.....	66 Hypothesis
2.....	
.....	68 viii Hypothesis
3.....	
.....	9 Hypothesis
4.....	
.....	71 Limitations of the Study
.....	71
Future research	
.....	
.....	74 Conclusions
.....	
.....	6 APPENDIX A: THE SOCIOCUTURAL ATTITUDES TOWARDS APPEARANCE QUESTIONNAIRE (SATAQ-3)
.....	
.....	79 APPENDIX B: THE MEDIA AND YOU SURVEY
.....	82 APPENDIX C: PERMISSION TO USE THE SATAQ -3
.....	85 APPENDIX D:

INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD

.....	8	LIST OF REFERENCES
.....		
.....	90	ix LIST OF FIGURES Figure 1: Before and After Stills of the Dove Evolution Film 14 Figure 2: Importance (awareness) scores for groups 2 and 4 pretest and posttest 55
.....	55	x LIST OF TABLES Table 1 Rotated Component Matrix of the “ Media and You” Pretest 9 Table 2 Rotated Component Matrix of the Media and You Posttest 51 Table 3 Results of the Repeated-Measures Analysis of Variance of Importance Scores 54 Table 4 Results of the Repeated-Measures Analysis of Variance of Internalization Scores 56 Table 5 Results of the Repeated-Measures Analysis of Variance of Pressure Scores 58 Table 6 Results of the Repeated-Measures Analysis of Variance Athlete Scores..... 0 Table 7 Results of the One-Way Analysis of Variance 61 Table 8 Descriptives of Pretest and Posttest Scores 62
62	xi	LIST OF ACRONYMS/ABBREVIATIONS SATAQ-3 The Sociocultural Attitudes Towards Appearance Questionnaire xii
		CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION Introduction The six-hour bus ride from Phnom Penh, Cambodia to Ho Chi Min City (Saigon), Vietnam affords the curious foreigner a view into the simple life of Cambodian rice farmers as well as the urban bustle of Vietnamese cities and towns. Both rural and urban settings along this route share an intriguing feature with American culture: the prevalence

of television. The shacks surrounded by rice paddies contain only the bare necessities of rural Southeast Asian life: mats and bedrolls instead of tables and chairs, a few boxes to store bowls and clothes instead of closets and cupboards, the obligatory Buddhist altar and a battery-powered television set. Across the border, city neighborhoods resemble a dense field of dandelions as TV aerials of uniform height and shape sprout quaintly from the houses. These two cultures of Indochina may be very different from the United States, but a common bond is our love for TV. Media reaches around the globe. Need for the Study The prevalence of the electronic media in the lives of America's youth can hardly be overstated. A Kaiser Family Foundation report on the nearly insatiable media habits of young people labeled today's 8-18 year-olds as ? Generation M? (Rideout, et. al. , 2005). One factor is the amount of exposure of today's youth to media. American students in grades 3-12 spend 6. 3 hours per day with the media, more hours in a week than the standard full-time job. College students spend six times as many hours in playing video games and watching television than in reading books (Prensky, 2001). The second factor 1 is the lack of parental control over the media accessed in the typical home. Rideout et al. found that less than half (46%) of the homes studied had guidelines about television watching; only one-fifth of these homes enforced the rules. Among junior-high and high school students, only 23% of homes had rules about computer usage, 16% had guidelines about music selections and only 25% had home computer filters. Rideout et al. Iso found that few parents screened the media content of their children by reading the advisory labels before purchase (14% for CDs; 10% for video games) and a minimal amount

(6%) used the parental control technology available for television. Ziegler (2007) stated, "With the high degree of access and the low degree of screening and monitoring of media content (by government or parents), media producers have carte blanche influence over Generation M" (p. 71). In our own media-saturated culture the challenge of how to process media involves two discrete dimensions: the quantity of media exposure and the quality of media content. First, there is simply too much media content for us to process (Potter, 2004). Television broadcasts are available 24-hour per day, seven days per week. The typical household television set is on for seven hours of the day, and children and teens spend about the same amount of time with new media (Bergsma, 2008). Internet access at home means that there are more ways to spend time with computerized mediated communication. The new media is not only emerging, but converging as telephones become PDAs and more people use their phones to send email and text messages, surf the web, watch movies and listen to music. The impact of media, particularly TV, has long been debated as critics have claimed that heavy TV viewing shortens the attention span of children and hurts their education (Fisch, 2002).² There is reason to be concerned over media effects upon users. Some research studies reveal a number of negative effects (Zeigler, 2007). A study of African-American teenage girls found that heavy viewers of rap videos were more likely to engage in violent behavior, drug and alcohol use and promiscuity (Wingood et al. , 2003). Anderson's metaanalysis of 32 independent research study samples linked exposure to violent video games to aggressive cognition and "serious" aggressive behavior (Anderson, 2004, p. 113). Concern over media content

started before the reaction to Rhett Butler's infamous parting profanity in the 1939 epic ? Gone with the Wind.? Research pioneers Harold Laswell and Paul F. Lazarsfeld studied the effects of propaganda and radio in the 1930s (Rogers, 1994). More recently, populist voices have responded to parental alarm at media content. In 1998, a full-page New York Times advertisement endorsed by veteran actor Steve Allen called on concerned parents who were ? fed up with steamy unmarried situations, filthy jokes, perversion, vulgarity, foul language, violence, killings, etc? to send money to the Parents Television Council to urge advertisers to ? stop sponsoring sex, violence, filth and sleaze? (New York Times, October 14, 1998). Despite the outcry against objectionable material on television some researchers are cautious about blaming the media for direct effects upon viewers. (e. g. Klapper, 1960) laying the groundwork for a limited effects perspective on mass media (Rogers, 2002). These limited effects are not insignificant. Heavy TV viewers adopt an inflated sense of the crime rate or ? mean world syndrome? (Gerbner, 1972), which leads to fear of going out at night (Gerbner, Gross, Morgan & Signorielli, 1994). Some heavy television viewers and video game users become de-sensitized to violence as a result of increased exposure to it (Buchanan, et. al. , 2002). 3 Some of these significant effects are alarming because of the importance of the media to society. A Mediawise report blamed the media for a ? culture of disrespect? and asserted, ? Whoever tells the stories, defines the culture? (Walsh, et. al. , 2004). As a sex information source for young people, television has increased in popularity. In 1998, 29% of young people listed television as their most important source of sex information (running second to peers), up from 11% in 1986 (Stodgill, 1998).

Rich (1999) concluded that among young people the media has emerged as a ? super-peer.? Sexual content can be subtle and is rampant in advertizing for a wide variety of products (Harris and Scott, 2002). Although they did not find network television to be explicit in its portrayal of sexual content, Greenberg and Hofschire (2000) found that sexual innuendo is prolific and premarital and extramarital sexual activity is represented six times more than between married partners. The research on sex in the media shows that exposure can ultimately affect behavior. Despite the catharsis theory to the contrary, an increase in viewing sexual material increases sexual arousal and increases the likelihood of engaging in sexual behavior (Harris and Scott, 2002). For adults, exposure to sexual material might also affect satisfaction. Research by Zillman and Bryant (1988) demonstrated that both men and women who regularly watched pornographic films reported less satisfaction with the appearance and affection of their partners. Pornography can also affect attitudes about rape. Zillman and Bryant (1984) found that persons who were repeatedly exposed to sexually explicit material recommended less prison time for rapists. Violent media content has been a concern for over a hundred years, first notably in Chicago when local authorizes refused to permit theatres to show the film *The James Boys* 4 in Missouri. The Payne Fund Studies in the 1930s revealed surprising violence in movie theaters—not only on the screen but in the seats. In research conducted by Edgar Dale (1935), the content analysis of 1500 movies revealed an alarming amount of crime content. Furthermore, in Herbert Blumer’s survey of 2000 people, respondents confessed to imitating acts of violence witnessed in the movies. As TV spread in the 1950s government officials became concerned over

violence in television and over the next two decades various groups debated the issue. The history of the debate over the past century has set the stage for researching violence in the media based on quantifiable data. There is a ? clear consensus? among scholars that exposure to violence in the media causes aggression (Sparks and Sparks, 2002, p. 278). There are several ways in which media violence affects viewers. One way is that the media teaches viewers what behaviors to imitate. Bandura (1965) applied Social Learning Theory to explain the effect of media violence: behaviors that viewers see rewarded are most likely imitated. Thus, when violent characters are not punished or their acts of aggression are glorified, their behavior is more likely to be imitated. Another effect of media violence involves priming, providing cues for aggression that interact with one's emotional state to provoke violence or aggression (Jo and Berkowitz, 1994). Other effects of exposure to media violence happen to be opposite in nature: desensitization and fear. Desensitization is the subsequent reduction in emotion from repeatedly witnessing violence. The negative impact could include a reluctance to aid victims or a reduced inhibition against committing violent acts (Dexter, et. al. , 1997). The fear response to exposure to violence can last for years, especially for a child (Cantor, 1999). 5 Despite the wide body of research that shows a variety of media effects, critics (network programming executives, for example) have a valid point: the media does not affect all audience members automatically. The hypodermic needle theory of direct effects has long been discounted by scholars, although it is resurrected in the public sphere by the occasional accusations of racism, political bias or influence upon the consumer in the media (Petty, Priester,

and Brisco, 2002). The evidence in support for this view of a powerful media is anecdotal. Scholars prefer the limited effects model, which recognizes that some media content can affect some people in some ways. These indirect effects, such as agenda setting and the cultivation effect, can be strong but they are the result of some very complicated variables. Nevertheless, the end result is that the media can teach us what to think about (agenda setting) and what to think (cultivation effect). McCombs and Shaw (1972) examined the ability of the media to influence public opinion in a study of uncommitted voters in North Carolina in the presidential elections of 1968 and 1972. The study of the prior election did not reveal an ability of the media to change attitudes; this may be the result of the attempt of the media to be objective. However, when public opinion polls were compared to content analyses of newspapers, a high correlation became apparent. This agenda setting influence of the media is rather complicated; not only can the media give salience to an issue or candidate but also to the attributes of that subject of the news. Research on agenda setting is far reaching, and is apparent locally and nationally in our own country and has been confirmed in foreign studies as well. Bernard Cohen's (1963) oft-quoted remarks sum up the theory of agenda setting: 'The press may not be successful much of the time in telling people what to think, but it is stunningly successful in telling its readers what to think about' (McCombs and Reynolds, p. 10). Cohen's remark is valid as it relates to the short term, in the arena of politics, where much is made of the individual's ability to choose through voting. However, it is absolutely naive to deny that the media is successful in telling us what to think over a period of time. Harold Lasswell (1948) noted that one of the

social roles of the media is the transmission of the culture. Agenda setting in the media extends beyond politics to the attributes of our culture, specifically, to the ideal appearance of males and females (McComb and Reynolds, 2002). The long-term effect of the media on our thinking is the heart of cultivation theory. In the late 1960s George Gerbner began a longitudinal study of primetime television and its long-term contribution to the social perception of reality by heavy television viewers. The process of the interaction between viewer and programming is what he called cultivation (Gerbner, et al. , 2002). Television is the mass storyteller, and most programs fit the mold. Cultivation analysis is in contrast to the effects models that focus on a measurable before/after variable; it is the aggregate of years of heavy media consumption which brings viewers closer together in their worldview. Heavy television viewing can influence one's perception of reality to resemble the primetime world. As a result of cultivation heavy viewers of television tend to see the world as mean and dangerous and overestimate the actual crime rate and underestimate the kindness of strangers. Cultivation is also effected by television portrayals of older persons. Contrary to the message of television the elderly are not nearly extinct, but alive and well (Gerbner, et. al, 1980). 7 Cultivation effects can slowly undermine family taught values. Repeated exposure to sitcoms and movies depicting sexually active teens can cultivate an acceptance of premarital sex (Harris and Scott, 2002). In a three-year study of teens and their television viewing habits, Chandra (2008) found that heavy exposure to sexual content predicts teen pregnancy in females and also predicts pregnancy responsibility in males. The danger of erosion in family taught

values is not lost upon conservative advocacy groups such as the American Family Association, which claims 2.6 million supporters worldwide. The group's founder, Donald E. Wildmon, began the group in the late 1970s after being repulsed by unsavory programming content while watching television watching with his children. He soon organized a "turn off TV week" that garnered widespread attention. Some parents may be unwilling to ban television completely. Media affords a glimpse into the outside world. It provides educational content. But most of all, as with other electronic media, television entertains (Bryant and Miron, 2002). While there are advocacy groups concerned with changing the content of the media, others place the responsibility upon the viewer. Susan Ziegler (2007) summarized this point of view: "In our highly consumer-charged society, it is very difficult to change the culture of the media and how it serves the public. Therefore, it is essential to develop more educated consumers" (p. 78). An alternative to media abstinence is media literacy, defined by the Aspen Leadership Institute as "the ability to access, analyze, evaluate and create media in various forms (Aufderheide, 1993). In matters of pedagogy, media literacy is an inquiry-based approach to learning. Educators assert that it is central to critical thinking. The Center for Media Literacy proposes five core concepts and five key questions to ask about any media—questions that it claims can change the world. The questions and concepts are as follows: (1) "Who created this message?" based on the concept that all messages are constructed; (2) "What creative techniques are used to attract my attention?" based on the concept that media messages are constructed using a creative language with its own rules; (3) "How might different

people understand this message differently from me?? based on the concept that individuals experience the same message differently; (4) ? What lifestyles, values and points of view are represented in, or omitted from, this message?? based on the concept that media have embedded values and points of view; and (5) ? Why is this message being sent?? based on the concept that most media messages are organized to gain profit and/or power (Center for Media Literacy, n. d. b.). As Irving and Berel (2001) put it, Media literacy (sometimes referred to as ? media education?) promotes adaptive behavior by teaching individuals, often children, to evaluate media critically and, consequently, to reduce the credibility and persuasive influence of media messages. P. 103 Potter (2004) recognizes that media literacy is a term so widely-used that a Google search can currently return thousands of hits, and this is merely a fraction of the material created for the Internet related to media literacy. Media literacy involves media studies as well as education. Media studies have been around for a long time and involve the critical content of television. Some claim that the mainstream media has contributed to the status quo of society, although this is counterintuitive to those who think the media is too liberal 9 rather than too conservative. But in practice there is a third perspective and it involves the practical aspect of solving health issues that may be caused by media exposure: alcohol use, youth smoking and eating disorders caused by body image distortion. These studies are mostly empirical and quantitative because of the paradigm shift toward a desire for results. Thus, media literacy, if it is the solution to the problems of the media, may be filter, framework or vaccine. Purpose The purpose of the current study is to explore the effectiveness of a one-shot

media literacy treatment as intervention. Specifically, this study will test the ability of a short film to change attitudes toward appearance. UniLever, the parent company of Dove Soap, produced a viral video for the Internet entitled, "Evolution" that depicted an ordinary looking young adult female being transformed by makeup and digital manipulation into a billboard image. The evolution occurs at high speed: over four hours of work is compressed into the 75 second film. The film ends with the caption, "no wonder our perception of beauty is distorted," implying that media images are untypical of the general population. The techniques of the beauty industry are exposed and it proposes to promote skepticism. Thus our research question is "to what extent is the Dove Evolution film effective to teach media literacy?"

Theoretical Framework Media literacy finds its theoretical framework in the work of Paulo Freire (1970, 1973), the Brazilian activist who taught farm workers how to read to enable them to vote. Freire's view of education reflected a critical pedagogy that seeks to recognize and question hegemonic forces in society. Freire sought to empower through education to overcome oppression from societal and political hegemony. Since the goal of empowerment education is social improvement and self-improvement, the process of critical thinking about the media leads to empowerment and self-improvement, especially in the areas of health issues. One specific health issue relates to body image and eating disorders. Social Comparison Theory explains the tendency to draw conclusions about ourselves after comparing ourselves with others (Festinger, 1954). Social comparison can be made with others who are superior or inferior (Wood, 2000) and real or fictional persons (Wood, 1996).

The majority of media images represent the media ideal of thinness and attractiveness (Watson and Vaughn, 2006). Upward comparisons are made with those perceived to be higher in social status and serves as an incentive to make selfimprovements but these upward comparisons tend to depress mood (Wills, 1991). Three sociocultural factors are associated with negative body image: awareness of the thin ideal, internalization of the thin ideal and perceived pressures to achieve a thin ideal (Cafri, et al. , 2005). The Sociocultural Attitudes Toward Appearance assesses these three measures and includes the desire to be athletic like images in the media (SATAQ-3; Thompson, 2004). Research Hypotheses In view of the literature on media effects and the promise of media literacy as an alternate to media abstinence, the following hypotheses will be tested: 11 H1: The Dove Evolution film as one-shot media treatment will increase awareness of the media ideal. H2: The Dove Evolution film as a one-shot media literacy treatment will decrease internalization of the media ideal. H3: The Dove Evolution film as a one-shot media literacy treatment will decrease pressure to obtain the media ideal. H4: The Dove Evolution film as a one-shot media literacy treatment will decrease the desire to be athletic. Definition of terms Media literacy is defined as the ability to ? access, analyze, evaluate and create media in a variety forms? (Aufderhiede, 1993). Awareness, as measured by the SATAQ-3 is an ? acknowledgement of societally based appearance norms? (Thompson, et. al. , 2004). It is operationalized in the SATAQ-3 as recognition of the importance that society places on appearance. Internalization is ? the incorporation of specific values to the point that they become guiding principles? (Thompson, et. al, 2004, p. 294).

As used in this study, internalization is the extent to which a person ? accepts societal norms of size and appearance? and will change behavior to achieve that norm (Thompson and Stice, 2001, p. 181). Pressure is the negative effect resulting from outside sources, such as teasing or negative comments about one's weight, or perceived pressure from the media to achieve the media ideal of thinness. Athleticism, as operationalized by the SATAQ-3 is the degree to which a person would like to have an athletic body. Athleticism is a newer form of the media ideal as evidenced by the growth of exercise and fitness magazines as well as advertizing promoting an ideal physique (Thompson, 2004).

Design of the Study The evaluation of the Dove Evolution film as a one-shot media literacy treatment was accomplished through a Solomon four-group design to control for pretest and interaction effects. Four classes of speech communication at the University of Central Florida were selected as conditions. These classes were taught on the same day by the same instructor in the same room for three conditions and an adjacent, identical room for the fourth condition. The treatment, the Dove Evolution film lasts 75 seconds. In condition one, a posttest questionnaire called ? The Media and You? based on the SATAQ-3 was administered at the end of class. In condition two, a pretest was administered at the beginning of class and the posttest was given at the end of class. In condition three, no pretest was given; the treatment (the Dove Evolution film) was shown and immediately followed by the posttest; these were given at the end of class. The fourth condition contained all three elements: a pretest was given at the beginning of class and the Dove Evolution film was shown, immediately followed by the administration of the

posttest; these were given at the end of class. The scores of the questionnaire were collected for statistical analysis. Limitations of this Study There are some limitations to this study. First, the sample size (n= 108) was relatively small. Often the sample size affects statistical significance. Second, this study did not control for demographics such as age, race, religiosity or sex. This, too, could have affected the outcome in terms of statistical significance. Organization of this Dissertation Chapter One is an introduction to this study. It examines the problem, introduces the purpose of the study, and presents the research hypotheses. Chapter Two contains the review of the literature relevant to the study. The procedures for collecting and analyzing the data are outlined in Chapter Three. Chapter Four organizes and explains the results of the data analysis. Chapter Five, is dedicated to summarizing the findings, conclusions, implications for practice and recommendations for future research. Figure 1: Before and After Stills of the Dove Evolution Film 14 CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW Introduction Inexperienced researchers of media literacy will be puzzled by the literature. Despite British scholar Len Mastermann's (1985) description of media literacy as a vast field and scholar James Potter's (2004) report of his Google search yielding 87, 000 hits as being 'the tip of the iceberg' (p. 23), a simple search in education and communication databases for 'media literacy' will confirm faculty warnings that the research on media literacy is thin. Media Literacy may be a 'complex and dynamic phenomenon' (Christ and Potter, 1998) but to the neophyte researcher it is stubbornly enigmatic. Frustration awaits the uninitiated media literacy researcher because the field is under-organized and under-developed. Potter (2004) offers clarification

when he described the field of media literacy a ? patchwork of ideas? and explains: Among scholars, media literacy is really the convergence of three huge bodies of knowledge: media studies (the industries, content, and effects), human thinking (how people attend to messages and construct meaning), and pedagogy (how to help people access information, develop skills, and become educated). (p. 23). ? Media literacy? has been a convenient label for a variety of matters discussed in the public sphere. It has been applied to issues of public policy, critical culture, parental guidelines, elementary teacher guidelines, or the words of wisdom from Marshall McLuhan (Potter, 2004). Media literacy curricula in schools grew during the 1970s, waned in the 1980s and resurged in the 1990s (Singer and Singer, 1998). Ironically, the United States is the 15 leading exporter of media yet lags far behind other countries in media literacy education (Kubey, 1998). Another irony is the lack of pedagogy in the U. S. while schools spend an increasing amount of the budget on technology (Semali, 2000). The structure of the field of media literacy is still under-developed. This is reflected in the plurality of applicable theoretical frameworks, the diversity of definitions in the literature and in the activist groups claiming to be media literacy advocates. The field of media literacy cannot be traced to a single theoretical framework that covers it (Cantor and Wilson (2003). This is seen by the application of social comparison theory to understand the media as the problem and the application of critical pedagogy that focuses on the general strategy for the cure: empowerment education. The communication perspective itself contains diverse definitions. Potter (2004) reports an earlier attempt to conceptualize media literacy for a symposium for the

Journal of Communication by asking media scholars to articulate their own concept of media literacy (Christ & Potter, 1998). The responses, in essay form, were remarkably varied among the scholars. Adams and Hamm (2001) consider media literacy as being able to ? reate personal meaning? from the media. Anderson (1981) states that the skills of media literacy were to be used for ? some purposeful action? while Barton and Hamilton (1998; as cited in Margaret Mackey, 2002, p. 5-6) asserts that media literacy is an action that is social. Sholle and Denski (1995) consider media literacy to be a critical perspective, while Silverblatt and Eliceiri (1997) concur and add that it ? empowers? the development of independent judgment about media. Hobbs (1997) defines media literacy as the ? ability to access, analyze, evaluate, and communicate messages in a variety of forms.? 16Potter (2004) sees this variety in responses as proof of wide interest in the topic but a need to unify different perspectives. Hobbs (1997) echoes the 1992 Aspen Media Literacy Leadership Institute and repeated by the National Leadership Conference on Media (Aufderheide, 1993). This may indicate that this definition has taken root in the pedagogical perspective: the ability to access, analyze, evaluate and create media in various forms (Center for Media Literacy, n. d. a). The proliferation of citizen action groups on media literacy demonstrates the diversity of perspectives (Potter, 2004). Yet there are common themes. The Action Coalition for Media Education seeks to ? encourage critical thinking and free expression? while encouraging activism. The Alliance for a Media Literate America emphasizes ? critical inquiry, learning and skill building? instead of ? media bashing and blame? (AMLA, n. d.). Children Now focuses on critical thinking in young viewers. Citizens for

Media Literacy proposes that through critical thinking the fabricated stories in advertizing can be replaced with one's own stories. The Coalition for Quality Children's Media (KIDS FIRST!) teaches children to avoid programs with bias and seek programs with high artistic standards. The Media Awareness Network teaches children to read the media messages. Media Watch challenges ? abusive stereotypes and other biased images? in the media. The National Communication Association defines media literacy as being able to understand the subtleties and blatancies of media messages. The American Psychiatric Association is unique in its focus on violence in the media and the need for conflict resolution skills. The National Leadership Conference on Media defines it as the ability to access, analyze, evaluate and communicate messages in a wide variety of forms of literacy. The National Telemedia Council defines it as mindful viewing by questioning, 17 responding thoughtfully and even producing media both in print and non-print formats. The New Mexico Media Literacy Project defines media literacy as the ability to critically consume and create media, and this gives freedom to the consumers of the media. The Northwest Media Literacy Project is about critical assessment of the media and awareness of its effect on our planet. Finally, the Office of National Drug Control Policy seeks to help consumers protect themselves against media messages that glorify drug use. While the most common themes are awareness and skill-based critical thinking; some groups specifically recognize the need for access and production, indicating that they have bought into the definition of ? the ability to access, analyze, evaluate and communicate media in its various forms? as publicized most visibly by the Center for Media Literacy (Center for

Media Literacy, n. d). There is more to media literacy than understanding a specific message. Duran, et. al. , (2008) argue for a contextual perspective on media literacy so that the media literate person is one who not only understands the text of a message, but the context as well. To know the context means to understand what types of persuasive messages exist in the media, why media messages look as they do, who creates the messages, when we are affected by media, where alternative media can be located, and how to be an activist for change. Critical thinking is a desired outcome of media literacy education, teaching students to deconstruct, analyze and evaluate (Yates, 2004). Paradigm Shift Media literacy is evolving from academic exercises in critical analogy to practical interventions for various public and personal health issues. Activist groups such as the 18 Alliance for a Media Literate America (2001), inspired by the critical pedagogy of Paulo Freire (1970, 1973), still emphasize the importance of critical thinking skills to empower citizens at home, work and school, or as voters. Freire's empowerment education would ideally lead to social and individual improvement. In today's results-oriented society media literacy education is now being used as interventions to improve personal and public health issues (Bersgma, 2004). In recent years researchers have become interested in measurable outcomes of media literacy education. Reviews of the literature have appeared in journals (Singer and Singer, 1998; Livingstone and Helsper, 2006), and seminars (Carney, 2006). Singer and Singer (1998) found the literature to be strong in critical viewing pedagogy but weak in empirical studies, a deficit that occurred despite the growth in media conferences domestically and in Europe. This review concluded with a call to

produce research that will convince school administrators of the value of media literacy. Like physicians who are presented with sick patients, the Committee on Public Education of the American Academy of Pediatrics (CPEAAP, 2001) diagnosed American children with ? violence and aggressive behavior, sexuality, poor academic performance, body concept, self-image and nutrition; dieting, obesity, substance use and abuse patterns? (p. 423) and pinpointed media as the cause for poor health. Seven years after Singer and Singer's (1999) review, attention turned to the effects of advertizing upon children. Livingstone and Helsper (2006) argued that media literacy is the key to whether children, regardless of age, are affected by it. In their review of the growing body of media literacy studies centered on advertising and food choice they discovered that younger children were susceptible to non-argument issues while older children were more susceptible to the argument of the 19 advertisements. For future research they recommended giving attention to both older and younger children rather than the middle range and giving greater attention to the theory that supports the observed effects of advertising effects. Finally, they argue for a reinterpretation of the literature and its application to policy, an intervention and evaluation of media effects. The most valuable systematic review of the literature on media literacy to date was done by Bergsma and Carey (2008) to determine the effectiveness of media literacy in promoting health education. They conducted a review of research studies since 1990 to discover the context and process elements of an effective health-promoting media literacy education intervention. Their methodology was a systematic review of the research that searched specific databases with specific keywords and found

that the intervention setting, length, skills taught, and who taught the intervention were the dependent variables. Based on outcomes, they also assigned effectiveness ratings as their independent variable. For their key word search they used ? media literacy,? ? media education,? ? television education,? and ? media analysis,? in health related indexes. They reviewed study references and articles, books, reports, etc. and initially found a sample of 65 studies but through exclusion/inclusion principles they narrowed them down to 23 studies. Surprisingly, the vast majority of these studies were domestic: two of these studies were published in Australia, two were published in the Netherlands, and nineteen were published in the United States. Specific criteria were used to justify inclusion or exclusion from Bergsma and Carey's (2008) review. First, the authors reviewed studies from 1990 until July 2006 (the 20 most recent date available). The second criterion was peer-reviewed, publicly viewable studies available through a searchable index. In addition, the studies must include a thorough methodology. The intervention must be 25 minutes or more in length. It was assumed that extremely short interventions of five minutes, for example, could not teach media literacy skills. The study focused on teaching media literacy skills rather than media literacy being part of a larger curriculum. These skills were operationalized as the ability to access useful media, analyze media messages using critical thinking skills (identifying bias and source credibility; determining fact from opinion, identifying the purpose of a message), evaluate a message in terms of truthfulness and relevance, and create messages according to specific goals. This review deliberately excluded from study the interventions that taught resistance skills or

strategies to limit exposure. Within the twenty-three studies that met the inclusion criteria were twenty-eight interventions. The health issues in Bergsma and Carey's (2008) studies under review included violence prevention (six), body image distortion (1), nutrition (two) and eating disorders (nine). Some studies involved children (13), while others involved teens (seven) and the rest involved college students (3). Most of the studies had a control group (19) or two control groups (one), but three studies had no control group. The studies' interventions also varied in terms of setting, length, who taught the intervention, core concepts taught and effectiveness of the intervention. Nineteen interventions occurred during the regularly scheduled class time, three in school but outside of class, three in community groups, one both in-class and in community groups and two studies did not specify the setting. In many cases (11) the researcher delivered the interventions, but at least in one case was assisted by the instructor. Teen peers delivered four of the interventions; two of the 21 interventions were delivered by college students. Classroom teachers delivered the intervention in three cases. In one of the studies Girl Scout troop leaders delivered the intervention. In six studies the intervention deliverer was not specified. The intervention lengths in Bergsma and Carey's (2006) review ranged from 25 minutes to 24 hours and were grouped into long (5 hours or more), average (1-5 hours) or short (less than one hour). There were eight long interventions, nine average, and 11 short. The interventions were categorized into the five core concepts: all media messages are constructed (all 28 interventions); media messages are created using a creative language with its own rules (17 interventions taught

this); different people view the same message differently (19 interventions); media have embedded values and points of view (28 interventions); and most media messages are constructed to gain profit and/or power (thirteen interventions taught this). Evaluating intervention effectiveness proved to be a challenge by the varied designs and outcomes of the studies in Bergsma and Carey's (2008) review. The outcome measures were grouped into the following categories: health issue, design of the study, theoretical framework, outcomes, pre- and post-test results, re-test results and elaborated results. No conclusion was drawn from the length of treatment, because both effective and ineffective interventions are both long and short in this study. This review found no study on the prevention of sexual practices. Most health promoting media literacy programs are conducted in schools; there is no data to suggest that non-school settings would be ineffective. This review of studies has provided insight for future research, which should focus more on behavioral outcomes rather than knowledge or attitudes.

22 Review of Studies To inform this study of the effectiveness of the Dove Evolution video as a one-shot media literacy treatment, the review of the literature followed a strategy similar to Bergsma and Carey's (2008) landmark review. The inclusion criteria were more liberal due to the researcher's initial experience with the thinness of the literature. First, the search term "media literacy" in Dissertation Abstracts yielded empirical studies that were examined to gain familiarity with the empirical research, including various instruments and methodologies and cited sources in the field. Further, the databases used to find peer reviewed research were expanded to include databases related to the three bodies of literature that

make up media literacy (Potter, 2004): ERIC for education, Communication Studies, Communication & Mass Media Complete for media studies, and PsycInfo and Sociological Abstracts for health intervention. In addition, health related databases were included in the search. To maintain consistency, the subject search was limited to "media literacy" (in quotation marks) and "intervention." On data bases that provided the option, "empirical studies" were selected. The inclusion/exclusion search criteria yielded 25 studies, a sample size similar to the final number Bergsma and Carey (2008) found with their wider search (fielding suggestions from colleagues) but narrower criteria. The studies informing the current study fall into the following categories based on health issues or skills taught: eating disorders (8), nutrition (2), sexual objectification (4), smoking (4), critical viewing skills (3), violence (2), and adolescent decisions about alcohol use (1) and media skepticism (1). 23 As with the Bergsma and Carey (2006) review, this search found no empirical studies on media literacy as intervention concerning responsible sexual behavior. A competent analysis of the literature is orderly and purposeful. If done well the literature review will accomplish certain things: explicitly justifies what is included in the study; gives the broader context of the literature, examines research methods to test whether stated claims are warranted, clarifies past findings and what is lacking; and synthesizes the literature to formulate a new perspective (Boote and Beile, 2005). It is important to be systematic and objective in reviewing the literature. Even studies in journals can be found to be unimpressive (Ward, Hall, and Schramm, 1975). As in Bergsma and Carey's (2008) review of the literature, these studies will be scrutinized for

the outcomes of media literacy skills and concepts taught. Media Literacy as Intervention for Critical Thinking Skills Three studies dealt with critical thinking: (Tidhar, 1996; Desmond, 1997; Hobbs and Frost, 2003). Tidhar (1996) tested the intervention effectiveness of Israeli TV in teaching critical thinking skills in a controlled experiment carried out in ten kindergartens divided into pairs matched by characteristics and randomly assigned to experiment and control groups. The participants were 150 preschool children, approximately half of them were low socioeconomic background and half were middle class. The intervention lasted five months and consisted of a pretest and a posttest. Statistical analysis of the quantitative data indicated that the posttest scores increased for the experimental group. The experimenters concluded that the media literacy skill of critical thinking was successfully taught although there were many questions left for further study. Desmon (1997) tested 24 the efficacy of an at-home intervention for young children involving parents. The sample consisted of 73 inner city school children in either first or second grade. The study used a pretest/posttest with a control group, and students had either personalized or nonpersonalized books. The time between pretest and posttest was five months. The intervention attempted to teach media literacy concept one (media messages are created) and it tested their ability to distinguish between TV and reality. In teaching concept two (media messages are constructed using a creative language and special techniques) it taught them about special effects). In teaching concept five (media messages are constructed to gain profit) it taught them about commercials. The results of this study showed a significant increase in awareness of the television

industry in general. This study worked better for the second-graders than the first-graders. Hobbs and Frost (2003) sought to test the effect of a yearlong media literacy curriculum upon high school juniors' ability to think critically. Using a demographically matched control group, the study showed the critical thinking skills of the experimental group improved. Other measures improved as well so that students in the experimental group gained the media literacy skills based on the five core concepts.

Media Literacy as Intervention for Alcohol Use

One of the most popular studies of media literacy as intervention is Austin and Johnson's (1997) study on third graders' decision-making regarding alcohol. This study used a Solomon Four-Group design, with a pretest, treatment and immediate posttest. It also utilized a delayed posttest given after three months to half of the participants. The participants were tested concerning alcohol advertisements in the categories of understanding persuasive intent, realism, social norms, similarity, desirability, 25 identification, expectancies, and violence. All five of the core concepts were addressed in this study. This study found an increase in understanding for many of the variables studied and effects remained strong for delayed posttest. This study is one of the most cited in the literature concerning media literacy interventions. However, the limitation is that it measures behavioral intentions; perhaps considering the limitations of using third-graders as participants, it could not be expected to do better than measuring the potential of alcohol use rather than its actual use.

Media Literacy as Intervention for Violence

Three studies were found concerning violence (Cantor and Wilson, 2003; Nathanson, 2004; and Rosenkoetter, et. al. , 2004). Cantor and Wilson's (2003) review of the research demonstrates

the role that adults can have in mitigating violence through comments during media exposure to violence. They also found that interventions vary by effectiveness according to age and sex and they call for more research to determine the best approaches by parents, and media literacy presentations to reduce aggression. Nathanson (2004) conducted an experiment using two approaches to modifying children's response to violence: evaluative and factual. Using two age groups, children aged 5-7 and children aged 10-12, Nathanson found that the evaluative approach, commenting on the morality of the acts depicted was superior to the factual approach (explaining the media production techniques to show that the violence wasn't real. In the case of the older children the factual approach might have detrimental results. This experiment taught media literacy core concepts one (media messages are constructed) and two (media messages use its own language). Teaching the older children the media techniques for simulating violence did not help as much as the evaluative comments (which would be 26 core concept four—media messages have embedded values and points of view). Rosenkoetter, et. al. (2004) studied 177 children in grades one through three in a year-long study consisting of 31 brief lessons in a classroom setting. The lessons taught media literacy core concept one (media messages are constructed) by teaching that the media distorts violence. This intervention was successful in reducing aggressive behavior in boys and less viewing of TV violence and identification with violent characters with girls. Media Literacy as Intervention for Smoking Three studies were examined on the effect of media literacy on smoking: Banerjee and Greene (2007), Gonzales, et. al. , (2004), and Pinkleton, et. al, (2007). Banerjee and Green (2007)

studied two intervention workshops using a combination of analysis—based on core concept one (media are constructed messages) and production—teaching the media literacy skill of creating media). Inoculation theory framed this study of junior high school students. The most successful of the three conditions was the combination of analysis and production (Gonzales, et al. , 2004). Although the non-diversity of this study was an admitted limitation, the study of a predominately Hispanic population was appropriate for the current trend of Hispanic youth smoking. Pinkleton, et. al, (2007) conducted a Solomon-Four Group experiment to test the effectiveness of a two-year media literacy curriculum using 723 participants. The study found that smokers and non-smokers were affected differently by the curriculum. This intervention effectively taught media literacy core concepts one (media are constructed) and five (media messages are created for profit). 27 Overall these studies on smoking and media literacy set out to accomplish the most basic media literacy objectives, awareness of the nature of media messages. What remains is to discover whether the acquisition of media literacy skills affects tobacco use. Media Literacy as Intervention for Sexual Objectification More recent studies have examined sexual objectification (Reichert, LaTour, Lambiase, and Adkins, 2007; Choma, Foster, and Radford, 2007) and internalization of the media ideal (Yamamiya, et. al. , 2004). Reichert, et al (2007) studied the effect of a media literacy video that detailed how women are displayed as sexual objects. As expected from previous research, women reacted negatively to media portrayals as compared to women in the control group. However, men were not affected by the treatment. This study supported a strong gender effect that needs to be explored in future studies.

Choma, et al (2007) conducted two studies using the video Slim Hopes and objectification theory as the theoretical framework, with the distinction made between state self-objectification (viewing self as an object when in certain situations) and trait self-objectification (the individual tendency to view self as an object). Exposure to the Slim Hopes video had multiple effects.

Negatively, the video heightened selfobjectification in both studies, even after controlling for trait self-objectification. On the positive side, however, the viewing of the video seemed to overall empower the participants in the study. The study was limited by the sample size (white young women and older adolescents), relatively small effect sizes of various scores, and the context (non-clinical population).

Yamamiya, et al. (2004) investigated why not all women are affected by exposure to the media ideal and tested internalization as a moderating variable. In two experiments, 123 young college women were studied. Women who were high in 28 internalization were affected by exposure to the media ideal. The media literacy treatment taught core concept one (related to critical thinking) helped reduced the adverse reaction of the media. Media Literacy as Intervention for Eating Disorders Some researchers have studied the food preferences of children to develop media literacy curricula as educational tools to foster good eating habits (Hindin, Contento, and Gussow, 2004). Others have studied the impact of a food preference media literacy intervention on parents (Evans, et. al, 2006). While these studies are more educational than interventional they are important to lay the foundation of good eating habits into teenage and college years. Pathological eating disorders have received an increasing amount of attention and the studies are adding to the body of knowledge.

Research expanded to include variations in the population. Kalodner (1997) broke new ground by studying non-eating-disorder college students (usually a control group), and Coughlin and Kalodner (2006) studied college women at both high- and low-risk for eating disorders using a specific media literacy program called ARMED. Further progress in the research occurred as Watson and Vaughn (2006) investigated the relationship of a media literacy treatment's length to its effectiveness finding that shorter-term treatments are not as effective as longer-term treatments. Stice and Ragan (2002) developed a more intense psychoeducational intervention with some success. Bissell (2006) found that one's desire to be thin to be linked with her visual literacy. 29 Research on body image progressed as well. A video called ? Slim Hopes was compared with two media-literacy programs to study the effect of media skepticism (Irving and Berel, 2001). Cafri, et al. (2005) found three sociocultural factors associated with negative body image: awareness, internalization and pressure to achieve a thin ideal. Calogero (2005) identified self-objectification (the tendency to view one's body as an object) as a link to eating disorders. Research by Buchholz, et. al. , (2008) has expanded the body image literature to include female athletes in a study of the media literacy curriculum BodySense. These studies are discussed below. To test the ability of externally- vs. internally-oriented interventions to promote skepticism toward the media and reduce negative body image, Irving and Berel (2001) compared a video-only intervention to a no-intervention and two different interventions, externally-oriented and internally-oriented. The authors were aware that targeting awareness of the media ideal of thinness might not be enough to affect body dissatisfaction

and therefore sought to use the internally-oriented intervention to accomplish it. It was hypothesized that an externally oriented intervention could raise critical awareness of the media but not reduce the internalization of the media ideal of thinness. It was also hypothesized that an internally-oriented intervention could reduce internalization of the media ideal of thinness and therefore could reduce body dissatisfaction. The interventions fell into two categories: internalization and externalization. The methodology was to use 110 female college students randomly assigned into four groups: no intervention (n= 24), a video-only intervention (n= 28), an externally-oriented media literacy intervention (n= 27) and an internally-oriented media literacy intervention (n= 31). The sample was derived from responses to a questionnaire 30 given to undergraduate psychology students six weeks prior. The two intervention conditions consisted of a 15-minute video followed by a structured discussion, for a total of 45 minutes. The video-only condition consisted of a viewing of the video followed by an informal discussion. In all four conditions the research participants completed a questionnaire at the end and the control group participants completed a questionnaire only.