

# [Education sector in pakistan](https://assignbuster.com/education-sector-in-pakistan/)

[Education](https://assignbuster.com/essay-subjects/education/)

The undermentioned subdivision provides an overview of the instruction sector in Pakistan and the development of this sector in context to the growing of the national economic system. Furthermore, this subdivision besides discusses the cardinal issues and jobs confronting the instruction sector with possible growing chances and chief aims of the paper that we seek to accomplish in this paper following the thesis.

## 1. 1 An Overview of Educational Profile, Educational inputs and Educational accomplishments in Pakistan.

Harmonizing to Tariq Rehman organize the National Institute of Pakistan Studies of the Quaid-e-Azam University, a thorough reappraisal of the system of formal instruction by the experts from the World Bank and other research institutes rendered the colleges here in Pakistan `` substandard, bureaucratic, hapless and inefficient '' . A unfavorable judgment every bit rough as this may raise excessively much wonder as to how so many alumnuss of Pakistan, including Engineers, Doctors etc, with merely a small extra preparation, were able to travel abroad and postulate in the field with those who have had received instruction from relatively advanced institutes. However, it holds rather a burden of truth in it ( Net Industries, 2011 ) .

Until the 1990s, a really limited sum of resources were allocated towards the instruction sector in comparative footings. merely 1. 1 % of the Gross National Product was constituted the public instruction outgo which increased to 3. 4 % by 1990. This addition in the financess allotment appeared rather unfavourable as compared to the defence budget in 1993, which was 33. 9 % of the GNP.

Throughout the history of Pakistan, at least until the 1990s, comparatively limited resources were allocated to instruction. In 1960, the public outgo on instruction was merely 1. 1 per centum of GNP ; by 1990, the figure had risen to 3. 4 per centum, though it compared rather unfavourably with outgos on defence, which stood at 33. 9 per centum of GNP in 1993 ( Net Industries, 2011 ) .

The instruction system in Pakistan is included among the most backward systems in Asia, empowered by the customary feudal and madarassa system. In 2004 the literacy rate was 52 % with male literacy much higher than that of female ( 64 % Vs 39 % ) . With the predominating unfairnesss in instruction with regionally and with regard to gender, the nucleus issue appears to be the relatively high budgets for higher instruction degree than forprimary and secondarydegrees.

The authorities has nevertheless, become cognizant of this state of affairs in the recent old ages and has put in an attempt to take on this job that is confronting the instruction system with respects to the defects in the budget allotment towards the basic degrees of instruction ( EIU, 2005 ) .

There are, in Pakistan, about 40 million kids that in the age bracket of 5 to 15 old ages, which is the conventional school traveling age. At Primary level the gross registration rate is 89 % and the dropout rate is 50 % . This implies that that the 18 million kids dropped out of primary degree, of the 36 million kids that are really enrolled. the extra 4 million kids that are deprived of entree to schools do up about 22 million kids of the entire 40 million who should be go toing the school. nevertheless, the instruction system in Pakistan is, unluckily, excessively lacking to provide to the demands of these disadvantages groups ( CEF, 2005 ) .

## 1. 2 Structure, Performance and Growth of the Primary Education Sector in Pakistan.

The duty of instruction sector lies with the provincial authoritiess. However, this function has been fulfilled throughout the old ages since the origin of Pakistan by the federal authorities, taking through reforms and policies for instruction on national degree and carry oning the necessary research for betterment in this field. Higher instruction degrees like universities, centres for research and excellence have been chiefly drawing resource financess from the federal authorities through a committee known as University Grant Commission. Furthermore all the educational establishments located in the federal district are run by federal disposal.

The Ministry of instruction is the caput, under which the federal ministry of instruction operates, and is assisted by the instruction secretary, a senior bureaucratism member. Educationsecretary appoints instruction curates that administer the provincial instruction sections in charge of the separate divisions of instruction catering to the demands of different degrees of instruction. The states are farther divided into territories and parts with separate governments divided between primary and secondary degree, with primary degree being administered by the territory caput while the secondary degree being administered by the part caput. The Colleges are on the other manus governed by educational board of directors at provincial degree ( Net Industries, 2011 ) .

Harmonizing to a study on the National instruction Policy published in 2009, the part of the private sector towards instruction makes up about a 0. 5 % of the GDP, which round up to be about 1/6th of the fiscal resources ( OECD, 2007 ) .

The construction of Primary, secondary, Higher-Secondary schools, Inter Colleges and universities is dominated by the populace sector accounting for about 64 % of the enrolment rates while the private sector merely contributed a portion of 36 % overall. However, the function of private sector has expanded over the old ages despite the lack reflected in the hapless comparative growing of this sector ( MOE, 2009 ) . The instruction system in Pakistan has been adulterated by series of issues that can be attributed to the educational dualism, connoting the English-Urdu, public-private and urban-rural derived functions.

This leads to educational unfairness that provides merely a cabal of pupils with choice instruction while bulk suffers from deficient instruction. These issues are faced at local, territory and national degree and are capable to political and federal concerns. Furthermore betterment in thisrespectis farther hindered by the corruptness and nepotism, including instructors with doubtful certificates make fulling in at responsible stations through illegal agencies while polluting the whole system. The deficiency of basic installations at schools at local and territory degree adds to the already deteriorating criterions of the instruction system in Pakistan whereas jobs associating to resource allotment and airing of financess have plagues the system at national degree ( CEF, 2005 ) .

## 1. 3 Millennium Development Goals: Targets and Accomplishments in Pakistan.

For Sustainable Development of Human Resource, the UN member provinces came up with a design of planetary partnership that was adopted in 2000 consisting 8 development ends ( Millennium DevelopmentGoals) . The chief ends of this partnership were to eliminate poorness and hungriness, Attain Universal Primary degree Education, Encourage Gender equity and authorising adult females, better wellness status and guarantee a sustainableenvironment. the effect of inordinate arguments brought about a model of 18 marks and 48 indexs to be incorporated in the examination of each end 's advancement ( Government of Pakistan, 2005 ) .

Pakistan adopted 16 marks and 37 indexs to detect the development of the Millennium Development Goals maintaining under consideration the company specific restrictions and resource handiness. Among these ends, one seeks to achieve cosmopolitan primary instruction guaranting betterment in the net registration rate, primary completion rate and literacy rate all over Pakistan without gender favoritism by the twelvemonth 2015. The MDGs besides reach out to authorise adult females and extinguishing gender disparity to all degree of instruction by 2015, which is mensurable by the Gender Parity Index ( Government of Pakistan, 2005 )

The Net Registration Rate in 2002 was 42 % as opposed to 46 % in 1991, bespeaking a diminution by 4 % in that decennary. This diminution was largely contributed by the turning tendency in population and poorness while the investing in decrease sector by the authorities remained low. Harmonizing to PSLM study ( Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey ) in 2004-05, the net registration rate indicated an betterment demoing a figure of 52 % for the study twelvemonth. A important betterment in this respect was recorded during the past four old ages. The lending factors in this respect included the demand and supply of educational reforms and other targeted plans, which induced an addition in the authorities budget for the instruction sector while heightening the engagement rate by the private sector at the same time ( Government of Pakistan, 2005 ) .

## 1. 4 Educational Dualism in Pakistan: A Rural-Urban Divide and Differentials in Investment in Education.

For the deficiency of unjust distribution of resources between rural and urban countries, the public presentation and end product generated from both the countries seem to portray the fact obviously through severally induced impacts and the spread. The drawbacks of rural countries start striking out more from secondary degree and worsen with progressive degrees.

Surprisingly plenty, for 2005-06 the Gross Enrollment Ratio degree at earlychildhoodinstruction degree for rural countries was in fact higher than degree that persisted in urban countries i. e. 93 % in rural countries as compared to 88 % in urban countries. At the primary degree GER in rural countries still exceed the GER degree in Urban countries but the spread was much narrower i. e. 85 % in rural countries as compared to 84 % in Urban countries. From secondary degree and onwards, for 2005-06, the statistics seem to demo the disadvantage being inclined towards the rural side with urban countries holding a GER at 48 % while it GER for rural countries dropped to 22 % and this per centum spread between the two countries has seemingly widened from 20 points in 2001-02 to 26 point 2005-06 ( MOE, 2009 ) .

Even more surprisingly, an anomalousness besides exists in the consequences of some steps of efficiency provided by the rural statistics, for illustration, repeat rates for Grade 1 in rural countries ( 3. 1 % ) as compared to that in urban country ( 2. 25 % ) . And this comparing holds its stance throughout the other classs at primary degree. For class 5, the repeat rate for rural countries was 2. 9 % against 2. 0 % in urban countries. However, the reign of surpassing the urban country is really limited in the favour of rural countries. The survival rate in urban countries is 94 % while it is merely at a 67 % in the rural scenes ( MOE, 2009 ) .

Similarly in footings of investing in instruction or input the statistics show the same favourable result boulder clay primary degree for rural countries but more slope of end product as we proceed on to upper degrees of instruction. The PupilTeacherRatio for rural countries is favourable holding 39 students per instructor as compared to the urban countries where ratio persists to 49 students per instructor. However, from secondary degree and onwards, the destinies of the rural-urban public presentation contrary as the result shows a preferred slope towards urban countries holding 12 students per instructor as compared to 18 students per instructor in rural countries ( MOE, 2009 ) .

Furthermore, the installations provided in the rural countries are scarce and deficient piece at the disbursal of rural schools, 90 % of urban schools tend to profit from H2O installations while merely 63 % or rural schools enjoy the installation and most of them suffer from hapless installations. sanitation installation provides the rural schools with a similar disadvantage. Where 88 % of urban schools are provided with proper sanitation installation, merely 56 % of the rural schools have this installation at their disposal ( MOE, 2009 ) .

## 1. 5 A Review of Educational Policies and Educational Reforms in Pakistan ; Issues, Concerns and Areas of Potential Improvement.

Since the origin of the state in 1947, the instruction policies have been coming in series and have been incorporated as that in the National Education Policy 2009. The reappraisal procedure initiated in 2005 for the National Education Policies runing from 1998 to 2010 and the first bill of exchange or papers, which is known as the 'White Paper ' was finalized in March of 2007.

The procedure of reexamining the policies in 2005 before the presently bing model ( 1998-2010 ) was started as a consequence of an induced inspiration to the Ministry of Education from two sensible factors.

The first chief ground was that the usher to policy model was rather unsatisfactory, owing to thefailurein accomplishment of the coveted educational consequences that were the intended ends of the policy. Performance of instruction sector lacked in the assorted cardinal factors, particularly the entree rates, educational chance equities and in overall quality steps.

The 2nd ground that stood out was that new challenges on planetary degree like the Millennium Development Goals and Dakar Education for All ( EFA ) have gathered huge mass in the past old ages and such aggressive demands need to be met with considerable step that need to be taken. Furthermore, globalisation and the attempt of states to accomplish a degree of an educated society or as they call it the `` Knowledge Society '' has stimulated the thirst for accomplishing better instruction criterions. Besides the planetary force per unit area that is necessarily faced, the desirable ends of accomplishing economic development and demographic passages on a domestic graduated table have rendered it mandatory to reexamine the policies for the interest of growing in educational quality ( MOE, 2009 ) .

The basic intent of these policies is to map out a scheme at national degree for educational development counsel in Pakistan and many of the policy actions that have been sketched out in the have already been put into drama in earlier reforms. These include development prospectus, policy for text edition stuff, losing installations ' proviso and other policies implemented on provincial and regional footing. The policy takes these inductions into considerations and structures them in its recommendations ( MOE, 2009 ) .

The effectivity of instruction system is greatly affected by the political societal and authorities substructure. To the extent that these factors impact the instruction sector, educational policies can non be formed without taking these factors into consideration. The instruction system is rather brooding of the societal norms and beliefs and militias upon itself rather an impact of these determiners ( MOE, 2009 ) .

All the contents of thesis until now may connote that Pakistan has shown advancement on many indexs mensurating the educational efficiency or result, nevertheless, the instruction system in Pakistan besides suffers from two major defects bespeaking an deficient entree to educational gaps and low quality of instruction that is provided. This depresses the criterions of instruction non merely on a local graduated table of comparing between the end product and the national ends but besides on an international degree to a greater extent excessively. The two chief causes responsible for such a loose public presentation of the instruction sector are: ( I ) Commitment spread and ( two ) Implementation spread. the former implies deficiency of committedness towards the educational ends taking to the latter that has frustrated the execution and practicality of policies ( MOE, 2009 ) .

Coping with the underlying jobs faced by the educational sector, a demand for an simple alteration in the idea procedure is in line that may impact the educational policies in a coveted manner. This demand of alteration in the though procedure is reflected in the Planning Commission 's study 'Vision 2030 ' which negotiations about some major inventions and alterations in the current system of instruction. This practical swing, nevertheless, calls for the demand, which takes into consideration, the public assistance of the pupils and the scholars alternatively of those who plan and implement the policies.

Handily plenty, the policy addresses this issue in the signifier of demand for suggestions and action plans the will cover with issues sing the vision, precedences and administration of the sector while besides covering with the jobs faced by single subsectors in an mixture with early childhood instruction at one terminal and grownup acquisition at the other ( MOE, 2009 ) .

## 1. 6 Keywords and Definitions.

Completion/Survival Rate to Rate 5

Dakar Education for All

Dropout Rate

Educational Dualism

Empowering Womans

Gender Disparity

Gender Equality

Gender Parity Index

Gross Enrollment Ratio

Gross National Product

Human Development

Literacy Rate

Millennium Development Goals

Ministry of Education

National Education Policy

Net primary registration ratio

Public Education Outgo

Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey

Primary Education

Secondary Education

Universal Primary Education

Vision 2030

## 1. 7 Study Objectives.

## Chapter 2: Literature Reappraisal

## 2. 1 An Overview of Educational Profile in Developed and Developing Countries.

Education is the driving force of alteration in the universe. Education ( which is non ever the same as schooling ) brings authorization. Without instruction, people can be capable to maltreatments by the most powerful. For illustration, illiterate provincials can be driven off their land by those who have entree to legal instruments which they can non act upon. A adult female, who does non hold entree to other points of position, may ne'er come to oppugn the arbitrary authorization her hubby has over her. Without instruction, people may be constrained to happen humble occupations that do non carry through them and others will look down on those who perform these occupations. Without instruction, those who are marginalized or oppressed may non hold the resources to denounce the unfairnesss they suffer from and to claim their rights. ( IDRC, 2009 )

There is an extended empirical literature on returns to education that focuses both on developed and developing states ( Jaffry, Ghulam, & A ; Shah, 2007 ) . Available literatures in developing states compare the returns toacademicinstruction and vocational instruction ( Nasir & A ; Nazil, 2000 ) , or seek to place the impact of finishing a given schooling rhythm on net incomes ( Appleton, 2001 ) .

## 2. 1. 1 Educational Spending and Educational Infra-Structure.

## 2. 1. 2 Educational Inputs and Dualistic Education.

The rural-urban divide has been a major country of survey in development economic sciences,

concentrating on rural-urban divisions within states, peculiarly with regard to

industrialisation ( Kuznets, 1955 ) . In more recent times, surveies on rural-urban

issues have focused on economic geographics, and its links to migration, urbanisation, trade

and economic growing. While legion surveies have considered the rural-urban educational divide within a individual state, there has been limited research on this issue across states ( Ulubasoglua & A ; Cardak, 2006 )

We find that states with greater resources and those with more effectual channels to apportion these resources have lower RUEI. Such distributional channels seem to be influenced by institutional model such as the legal system within a state, colonial history, and political stableness every bit good as geographical features such as being landlocked and/or a larger state. Specifically, states with legal systems of Gallic beginning ( Gallic legal system ) , on norm, have higher RUEI, while the contrary is true for states with legal systems of British beginning ( British legal system ) . Besides, states with colonial yesteryears in general, and the states with post-war independency in peculiar have higher RUEI. This may be related to the extractive instead than colony nature of settlements deriving independency in the post-war period. In add-on, states with less stable political environments, that are landlocked and those with larger surface countries have higher RUEI, proposing that such factors negatively influence effectual allotment of resources between R & A ; U countries, other things being equal. We besides find that RUEI is lower in economic systems with larger formal labour markets and better substructure, while riskier human capital investing and more limited recognition handiness are associated with greater RUEI.

The cardinal point is that instruction degrees are determined by the tradeoff between resource usage in thefamilyand formal markets. This is affected non merely by economic development within a state but by differences in development and chances between R & A ; U countries and the manner that nation-wide factors influence both R & A ; U households. 9 The undermentioned theoretical statements underpin our empirical analysis of cross-country differences in the ratio and the degrees of R & A ; U schooling old ages ( Ulubasoglua & A ; Cardak, 2006 ) .

## 2. 1. 3 Educational Outcomes and Achievements.

## 2. 2 Indexs of Assessing Educational Quality and Outcomes.

Educational Outcome indexs progressively are being used to measure the efficaciousness of American instruction. The growing of indexs of this type has been motivated in big portion by a turning demand to keep schools accountable for their public presentation, defined in footings of results, such as standardised trial tonss, instead than inputs, such as instructor makings, category size, and the figure of books in school libraries. Unfortunately, most schools and territories have non developed and implemented public presentation indexs that are wholly suited for this intent. As a consequence, many pedagogues and bookmans fear that these indicator/accountabilitysystems could badly falsify the behaviour of pedagogues and pupils and therefore be worse than holding no indexs at all. It is hence really of import to see the standards that define an acceptable, valid public presentation index system ( Meyer, 1997 ) .

Strengthening the quality of instruction has become a planetary docket at all educational degrees and more so at the primary degree. The quality of basic instruction is of import non merely for fixing persons for the subsequent educational degrees but to fit them with the necessity basic life accomplishments. Quality instruction besides ensures increased entree andequalityand it is chiefly due to these grounds that assorted international Forums and Declarations have pledged betterments in quality of instruction. National committedness towards quality instruction has become significantly seeable since the late 1880ss. From so onwards, the authorities has experimented a figure of enterprises and intercessions for bettering quality with national and foreign support ( Mirza, 2003 ) .

Despite the turning concern about the quality of instruction, its crystallised definition is slightly hard ( Aspin & A ; Chapman, 1994 ) , mostly due to a broad array of stakeholders and consumers along with the complexnesss of teaching-learning procedure which need to be unfolded continuously. Footings like effectivity, efficiency, equity, equality and quality are frequently used interchangeably ( Adams, 1993 ) . Most of the people view quality of instruction as the larning results of pupils which is the primary concern of all stakeholders. But to accomplish the coveted quality the ancestors, that is the input and procedure should besides hold quality in footings of efficiency, effectivity, excellence, and societal justness. The quality instruction end product can be achieved merely if quality is ensured at each degree of the educational procedure from standard scene, larning environment, teacher preparation, teacher-learning procedure, appraisal and monitoring ( Meyer, 1997 ) .

The Dakar Framework of Action 2000 defined quality of instruction in footings of recognized and mensurable larning results particularly in literacy, numeracy and indispensable life accomplishments. Article 42 of the Expanded Commentary on the Dakar Framework of Action farther elaborates that 'a quality instruction is one that satisfies basic larning demands, and enriches the lives of scholars and their overall experience of life ( UNESCO, 2000 ) .

The steps to achieve the needed quality were suggested as under:

1. Healthy, good nourished and motivated pupils.

2. Adequate installations and learning stuffs.

3. A relevant course of study.

4. Environment that encourages larning.

5. Clear definition of larning results.

6. Accurate appraisal of larning results.

7. Participatory administration and direction.

8. Prosecuting local communities.

The Recife Declaration of the E-9 undertaking reaffirmed about all the above

declared ends of instruction. It has besides mentioned the usage of modern engineering in

all facets of instruction ( Meyer, 1997 ) .

## 2. 3 Educational Policies, Centralization and Decentralization.

Several factors that spur instruction reform derive from the region-wide displacement to open economic systems and planetary competition. Two of these factors are particularly of import. The first is the turning centrality of cognition as a production factor. The 2nd is the increasing planetary character of information, communicating, and economic activity. Both these factors are aggressively increasing the demand for instruction. They are set uping a new and compelling economic statement for educational reform. They are besides doing powerful histrions outside educational systems - politicians, concern leaders, development-assistance establishments ( DAIs ) , and civil society more by and large - to press for better schools and a better quality of instruction ( Puryear, 1999 ) .

Pakistan took a sweeping attack to decentalisation. It introduced an ambitious program to devolve political and financial cardinal powers to new local authoritiess. A degeneration program was launched by the NationalReconstructionBureau, and during the short period of clip ( 18-month from March 2000 to August 2002 ) , the state created three degrees of new local authoritiess -districts, Tehsils ( urban and rural municipal disposals including metropolis towns ) , and Union Councils. Provincialfinancecommittees have been established in all four states to plan their ain transportation system. While there has been progress in devolving political powers, financial and administrative decentalisation are still dawdling behind.

- The financial transportation system from cardinal authorities to local authoritiess needs to be improved ;

- Support for the local authoritiess needs to be strengthened ;

- The designs of the provincial transportation system need farther betterments peculiarly to guarantee equalisation ; and

- Decision-making powers need to be transferred to local authoritiess.

- In December 2008, the Prime Minister constituted a commission to revisit the Local Government Ordinance, 2001, in order to take failings and better the Local Government System.

( World Bank, 2011 )

## 2. 4 Human Resource Development Policies and Changing Educational Policies.

## 2. 5 Regulatory Framework an Educational Reforms in Developing States.

## 2. 6 Millennium Development Goals on Education: Target Setting, Compliance and Performance Gaps.

## 2. 7 Opportunity Wage, Child Labor and Educational Outcomes.

Early child care and pre-school policieshave become an of import focal point of the authorities 's scheme for bettering the wellbeing of kids, either through the enabling consequence that child care has by leting parents to work or through other more direct effects of early instruction on kids. The purpose of this paper is to cast visible radiation on the inquiry of how effectual early pre-school and schooling are at bettering the wellbeing of kids, and whether any impacts are likely to be durable. In accomplishing this purpose, we add to a good established literature both from the UK and from around the universe ( Goodman & A ; Sianesi, 2005 ) .

An estimated 158 million kids aged 5-14 are engaged inchild labour- 1 in six kids in the universe. Millions of kids are engaged in risky state of affairss or conditions, such as working in mines, working with chemicals and pesticides inagribusinessor working with unsafe machinery. They are everyplace but unseeable, laboring as domestic retainers in places, laboring behind the walls of workshops, hidden from position in plantations.

In Sub-Saharan Africa around one in three kids are engaged in child labor, stand foring 69 million kids.

In South Asia, another 44 million are engaged in child labor.

The latest national estimations for this index are reported in Table 9 (Child Protection) of UNICEF 's one-year publication The State of the World 's Children.

Children life in the poorest families and in rural countries are most likely to be engaged in child labor. Those burdened with family jobs are overpoweringly misss. Millions of misss who work as domestic retainers are particularly vulnerable to development and maltreatment. Labour frequently interferes with kids 's instruction. Guaranting that all kids go to school and that their instruction is of good quality are keys topreventing child labor ( UNICEF, 2011 ) .

In Pakistan kids aged 5-14 are above 40 million. During the last twelvemonth, the Federal Bureau of Statistics released the consequences of its study funded by ILO 's IPEC ( International Program on the Elimination of Child Labour ) . The findings were that 3. 8 million kids age group of 5-14 old ages are working in Pakistan out of entire 40 million kids in this age group ; 50 per centum of these economically active kids are in age group of 5 to 9 old ages. Even out of these 3. 8 million economically active kids, 2. 7 million were claimed to be working in the agribusiness sector. Two million and four hundred 1000 ( 73 % ) of them were said to be male childs.

During the twelvemonth 2001 and 2002 the authorities of Pakistan carried out a series of audience of three-party spouses and stakeholders ( Labour Department, trade brotherhoods, employers and NGOs ) in all the states. The aim was to place the businesss and the classs of work, which may be considered as risky under the commissariats of ILO Convention 182 ( Arshad, 2007 ) .

## MATCHING WITH THE LABOUR MARKET

## Policy Actions:

1. Courses at the secondary and higher secondary degree shall be reviewed with a

position to doing them more relevant to the demands of the labor market in order to

better prepare those pupils non traveling on to farther surveies.

2. A survey shall be conducted to measure the impact of proficient matriculation and

explore ways of presenting an improved system of proficient and vocational

instruction at high school degree. The watercourse shall offer bipartisan nexus with the

academic watercourse and besides provide links to a revamped vocational and proficient

sector at higher degrees.

3. Approaches shall be found to supply pupils with a window to the universe of

work. This could affect short assignments with the local endeavors and

establishments or `` occupation shadowing ' attacks to familiarize pupils with the work

environment.

4. A calling counsel and service shall be introduced at secondary and upper

secondary degrees, if non in each school, at least for school bunchs. This shall

affect local employers in supplying information about occupation gaps and the

nature of work demands. ( MOE, 2009 )

## Chapter 3: Methodological and Analytic Choices

## Chapter 4: Appraisal and Analysis